Dear Talmidei Hayeshiva,

First of all, I must apologize for not getting out a newsletter for Sukkos. I hope we will be able to keep them coming out on a regular basis.

We have two special announcements: 1) Rav Solomon and Rav Ukelson will be in the New York area in January. Would any of you be available for a get together the evening of Tuesday Jan. 12? If you'd be interested, then please email your response to newsletter@torassimcha.org. If you don't have email, you may call 443-929-1423.

2) Any of you who have used Toras Simca credits, could you please contact us and tell us which universities or programs have accepted or not accepted them? Your replies will be much appreciated.

I thank you all in advance. A lichtigan Chanuka to all.

M. Pinck

After the defeat of the Yevonim by the Chashmonayim, Chazal instituted a tefila of thanksgiving, to be said annually on the anniversary of the Jews’ victory. This beautiful tefila, Al HaNisim, thanks Hashem for the miracles performed during their uprising. Yet hidden within Al HaNisim is a seemingly problematic verse. After describing the rededication of the Beis HaMikdash, the author writes, “and [the Chashmonayim] lit the lights [of the Menora] in Your holy Chatzer.” As the Menora was lit in the Heichal (the actual building) of the Beis HaMikdash, not the Chatzer, how can this phrase be true? In addition, the Gemara in Menachos (28b) states that the Menora must stand opposite the Shulchan, which was in the Heichal, not the Chatzer!

The Rambam, in Hilchos Bias Mikdash (9:7), permits a non-Kohen to light the Menora as long as a Kohen had cleaned out the old wicks and oil, and replaced them with fresh ones. If this had been done beforehand, the Rambam permits the Menora to be then carried out of the Heichal to allow a non-Kohen to light it.
While this could answer our questions, the Commentators on the Rambam find this puzzling. He previously states that the Menora must be lit in its place, seemingly implying a necessity for it to be lit opposite the Shulchan.

The Chasam Sofer resolves this issue by explaining that the latter Rambam does not restrict the Menora to being lit only in the Heichal, rather it just teaches us that the placement of the Menora in the Beis HaMikdash was opposite the Shulchan.

With this explanation of the Chasam Sofer, the phrase "Hidliku Neiros Bichatzros Kadshecha" is clear. The Menora was lit in the Chatzer. This line in Al Hanissim is preceded by an explanation of what the Chashmonayim did to clean the Beis HaMikdash of the Yevonim’s defilement, and make it suitable once again for Hashem’s presence. Since at the time of the lighting of the Menora the Heichal was still in a sullied and unpurified state, out of necessity was it lit outside.

Yet lighting in the Chatzer served a dual purpose. Besides for escaping the defilement of the Heichal, it also allowed the miracle of the lights lasting for eight days to be publicized to all of Klal Yisrael. Had the Menora been lit in the Heichal, only the Kohanim would have been able to witness this Nais.

The Menora being lit outside in the Chatzer can answer the Beis Yosef’s question of why do we celebrate the miracle of Chanukah for eight days? Since the jug of oil that was found held enough for a single day, what was miraculous about the first day? Chanukah should only be seven days long! The Chasam Sofer answers that the oil found in the jug was only enough for a single day if lit inside. As the Menora was lit outside and the lights were exposed to the wind and the elements, they required more oil to stay alight, making the first day also a miracle, making Chanukah eight days long.

As the Rambam previously established that it is Halachically acceptable to light the Menora outside of the Heichal, perhaps there is another explanation for the phrase "Hidliku Neiros Bichatzros Kadshecha."

In Maseches Midos (3:2), the Mishnah describes the appearance of the Beis HaMikdash. "Outside the wall of the Azara, was a low lattice-like wooden fence. When the Yevonim entered the Beis HaMikdash, they broke through it thirteen times. When the Chashmonayim succeeded in recapturing the Beis HaMikdash from them, they mended the breaches and instituted that whenever anyone would pass before the place where it had once been broken, they should bow and thank Hashem for conquering the Yevonim.

What purpose did this fence serve? As it was only ten tefachim tall, it could hardly be to keep anyone out? Was it for decoration? The Tosfos Yom Tov answers that it was a symbolic separation between Jew and Non-Jews. Although Non-Jews were allowed in the Beis HaMikdash to pray to Hashem, as Shlomo HaMelech says in Melachim I “all the nations will come to this house to pray to you," they were restricted to only as far as this fence. As this symbolized a difference between Jews and the rest of the world, the first thing the Greeks did was to break through it, signifying their ideals and aspirations, a complete removal of the boundaries between them and the Jews.

The Tosfos Yom Tov writes that the word Azara in the Mishnah is a borrowed term and does not necessarily mean the inside the Beis HaMikdash, rather it could refer to the Chatzer. The words "Hidliku Neiros Bichatzros Kadshecha" perhaps could be referring to this wooden lattice. The reason the Kohanim lit the Menora facing this fence was to show the world that they had reestablished the clearly defined boundaries between Hashem’s chosen people and the rest of the world. This separation was so important that the Rabbis initiated that they should bow and praise Hashem every time they passed the mended areas. This served to remind them of the consequences of mixing too closely with Non-Jews and thereby preventing such a tragedy from happening again.

Therefore Chanukah is a time when we look at ourselves and ask whether we have been successful at setting boundaries between ourselves and our Non-Jewish counterparts. Never before in history has the world been so accepting and open to Jews. With modern technology it has become easier than ever to have their thoughts, feelings and influences at our fingertips. But precisely because of this openness is it more important than ever to set guidelines to what Non-Jewish influences we accept into our lives and our homes. For without definite boundaries, their influences and our daily contact with them can affect our lives without our knowledge, causing untold spiritual harm. May this message of Chanukah light up our homes, and through it may we see a Geula Bimhera Biyamenu.
The words of HaNeros Hallalu Imply that since we cannot use the light of the neros, and only look at them, it is therefore proper “l’hodos u’lhalel”. Why is it that a prohibition of benefiting from the light should give more cause to sing Hashem’s praise?

Well known is the question of the L’vush: Why on Purim did chazal require “mishte and Simcha”, while on Chanukah there is no such requirement? He answers that on Purim we celebrate lives being saved, because Haman wanted to wipe out all of Klal Yisroel and to physically remove us from the world. On Chanukah, however, the Greeks goal was not to kill the Jews. They wished to attack our ruchnius. They wanted to break our bond with Hashem and with Torah.

The Taz asks: If so, isn’t it true that someone who tries to make a Jew sin is worse than one who tries to kill him, thereby making the miracle of Chanukah greater than that of Purim, so too providing more of a reason for a celebration of “mishte v’ simcha” on Chanukah than on Purim?

Many answer that while although the “nes” Chanukah may have indeed been a greater miracle than the “nes” Purim, the Nes of Chanukah represented a spiritual victory over the Yevanim. Therefore, it would be inappropriate to celebrate with “mishte v’simcha” which are methods of physical celebration. Chazal therefore implemented a requirement “l’hodos u’lhallel” which express the simcha of the Neshama for having been saved.

The Toras Tzvi, writes that this thought is represented in Halacha. We are forbidden to benefit from the Neros Chanukah because ner represents the neshama. That’s why the nes was done with lighting the menorah. In order to teach us that the main miracle of Chanukah was a spiritual one of neshamos being saved. This has no connection to physicality, thus we are forbidden to gain any physical benefit from the light, as not to diminish the great spiritual simcha of these days.

We can now understand the “Haneros Hallalu.” The Neros are kadosh, therefore we cannot use them for physical benefit. We can only look at them in order to realize that the essential miracle of Chanukah was that of the Neshamos of Klal Yisroel being saved.

May we all merit to live the miracle of Chanukah on its days and everyday as Torah and mitzvos continuously kindle the light of our neshamos singing “hodaah v’ hallell” to HaShem. A’lichtge Chanukah to the entire Toras Simcha Family!
Anyone in the UK who is interested in making a tax deductible donation to Toras Simcha may now do so thanks to the efforts of Robert Brayam and Zecharia Reznik. The account information is as follows: Account name: British Friends of Toras Simcha. Account number: 42485141. Sort code: 09-06-66. Anyone making a deposit is asked to also send an email to torassimchauk@gmail.com (especially if they want a charity receipt). Any charity vouchers can be sent to 40 Woodville Road, London, NW11 9TN. Unfortunately, checks or cheques can't be

MAZEL TOV to Rabbi Solomon and family on the marriage of his son Moshe Zahava Epstein.

MAZEL TOV to Rabbi Rosenthal and family on the marriage of his daughter Sarah Leah to Chaim Black and on the birth of two grandchildren: A son, Moshe, to daughter and son-in-law Shmuel Yaakov and Devorah Sperling and a daughter, Esther, to son and daughter-in-law Yechezkel and Leah Rosenthal.

MAZEL TOV to Rabbi Shidlovsky and family on the Bar Mitzva of their son Elchanan Bunim.

MAZEL TOV to Rabbi Katz and family on the birth of a grandson, Nesanel, A son, Moshe, to daughter and son-in-law Ahrele and Miriam Katz.

MAZEL TOV to Rabbi Friedlander and family on the birth of a grandson to Yisroel and Tehila Friedlander.